

12-18-2020

## **Child Protection Services: An Evaluation of the Current System and Recommendations for Preventing Instances of Abuse**

Sarah Varian  
skatvarian@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.csp.edu/teacher-education\\_masters](https://digitalcommons.csp.edu/teacher-education_masters)



Part of the [Early Childhood Education Commons](#)

---

### **Recommended Citation**

Varian, S. (2020). *Child Protection Services: An Evaluation of the Current System and Recommendations for Preventing Instances of Abuse* (Thesis, Concordia University, St. Paul). Retrieved from [https://digitalcommons.csp.edu/teacher-education\\_masters/35](https://digitalcommons.csp.edu/teacher-education_masters/35)

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@CSP. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Teacher Education by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@CSP. For more information, please contact [digitalcommons@csp.edu](mailto:digitalcommons@csp.edu).

Child Protection Services: An Evaluation of the Current System and Recommendations for  
Preventing Instances of Abuse

Sarah K. Varian

Concordia University, St. Paul

MA in Early Childhood Education

ED590 Course Instructor: Dr. Kelly Sadlovsky

Second Reader: Elizabeth Amirahmadi

December 10<sup>th</sup>, 2020

## Table of Contents

Abstract.....	3
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	4
What is Abuse?.....	4
History of Child Protection Services.....	7
Mandated Reporters.....	9
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	12
Factors that Influence Child Abuse.....	12
Effectiveness of the Current System.....	15
Parent Perceptions.....	19
Child Abuse Interventions.....	21
Parent Education.....	21
Home Visits.....	24
International Studies.....	26
Effective Methods.....	29
Chapter 3: Discussion.....	34
Insights Gained from Research.....	34
Addressing and Advocating for Children’s Rights.....	37
Future Studies.....	39
Conclusion.....	40
References.....	42

### Abstract

Millions of children are reported to Child Protective Services every year, and the services those children receive differ greatly between each state depending on the laws and regulations set in place and what community programs may or may not exist to support them. Research about what factors influence child abuse occurrences and which services best meet the needs of at-risk families is vital to determine the best ways to provide support for families reported for cases of abuse or neglect (Palmer, Maiter, & Manji, 2006; Solomon & Asber, 2012). A review of literature on this topic concluded that currently, Child Protective Services offices throughout the United States vary greatly in the effectiveness and consistency of support services. More funding to support necessary services that meet the actual and not perceived needs of families is needed to aid in reducing the number of cases reported (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Suggestions for future studies to continue studying effective intervention methods are also addressed in this paper.

*Keywords:* Child Protection Services, child maltreatment, abuse, intervention methods

## **Chapter 1: Introduction**

In 2018, approximately 4.3 million referrals were made to Child Protection Services (CPS) in the United States (Children's Bureau, 2018). Of those 4.3 million referrals, 21.1% of them were made by teachers and daycare providers (Children's Bureau, 2018). Early childhood educators are in a unique position to be able to advocate for children who may be suffering from abusive situations. A young child can spend up to 40 hours a week or more in the care of an early childhood educator which can lead to trusting relationships between the child and teacher. These factors can make teachers a strong support and advocate for a child who may be in an abusive situation; especially if the child is too young to advocate for themselves (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). Teachers are also able to observe and record aspects of a child's development, appearance, and behaviors on a daily basis (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). As outlined in the Federal Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act (CAPTA), all states in the United States are required to have professionals mandated to report child abuse if it is suspected, and in many states, this includes teachers and early childhood educators (Children's Bureau, 2019). While each state is allowed to make state specific laws and regulations regarding child abuse, the federal government provides guidelines about what constitutes as abuse to aid states in creating definitions of abuse (Children's Bureau, 2019b).

### **What is Abuse?**

In the United States, the federal government defines abuse as any action taken by a parent or other adult taking on caregiving roles, or lack of care that results in serious physical or emotional harm, sexual harm or exploitation, or puts the child at a serious risk for injury (Children's Bureau, 2019b). This broad definition laid down by the federal government is a framework for states to draft their own laws and legislature regarding child abuse (Children's

Bureau, 2019b). Each state varies in their specific definitions of what acts qualify as abuse; for instance, some states identify acts of domestic violence witnessed by a child to be a form of abuse, while others do not (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Though the details slightly vary from state to state, there are broad definitions to allow for general understanding of what constitutes as abuse.

### **Types of Abuse**

The Federal Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act defines child abuse in the simplest of terms as an act or failure to act when caring for a child that puts the child at serious risk of harm (U. S. Department of Health and Human Services, n.d.). Within this broad definition, more specific types of abuse can be defined as well. Physical abuse refers to when a parent or caregiver acts in a way that causes intentional physical harm to a child (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Physical abuse can be identified by a variety of signs, including unexplained or conflicting explanations for a child's injuries, child is afraid of a parent or caregiver, abuses animals, or has anxious, depressed, or aggressive behaviors (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Any act on the part of a caregiver that causes physical harm to a child is considered to be abuse regardless of whether the act was intentional or not (Childhelp, n.d.). Emotional abuse is very nearly the opposite of physical abuse, as it takes effect on a child's mental well-being rather than their physical well-being (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Emotional abuse refers to acts that take effect on a child's self-worth and mental well-being, such as threats, withholding of love or support, or excessive criticism (Children's Bureau, 2019b). While physical abuse leaves a child with visible injuries, emotional abuse is more difficult to identify and prove and generally occurs over a long period of time (Childhelp, n.d.; Children's Bureau, 2019b). Sexual abuse refers to when a child is a victim of rape, indecent exposure, molestation, prostitution, or partakes or

witnesses any other type of sexual act (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Sexual abuse may also occur when an older child uses another child as a source of sexual excitement or fulfillment (Childhelp, n.d.).

The most common type of abuse is neglect which encompasses any time a parent or caregiver fails to provide for a child's basic needs (Children's Bureau, 2019b). As neglect is defined as a failure to act rather than the manifestation of an act, neglect can be very difficult to identify or prove with concrete evidence (Turner, Vanderminden, Finkelhor, & Hamby, 2019). Neglect can be made more difficult to appropriately identify in situations where a family is experiencing poverty or homelessness or has cultural values that are difficult for others to understand (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Different types of neglect may occur on their own or alongside other types of abuse or neglect. Physical neglect refers to situations in which a caregiver fails to provide basic physical needs for a child, such as medical or dental care, appropriate hygiene care, or appropriate nutritional needs (Turner et al., 2019). Educational neglect refers to situations in which a caregiver or parents fails to provide a child with access to learning and education (Children's Bureau, 2019b).

Not defined as such by the federal government, many states also specify abandonment to be a form of neglect or abuse (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Abandonment occurs when a parent or guardian is not in contact with the child and has left the child in a situation that shows a serious disregard and care for the child's health and safety (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Another state specific form of abuse is parent substance abuse, defined as exposing children to legal or illegal drugs, manufacturing or selling drugs within the presence of a child, giving drugs or alcohol to a child, or using a legal or illegal substance excessively to the point that it impairs the caregiver's ability to care for the child (Children's Bureau, 2019b). Human trafficking, when involving

children, is another act that many states include in their definitions of child abuse (Children's Bureau, 2019b).

### **History of Child Protection Services**

In 1875, animal protection advocate Henry Bergh and attorney Elbridge Gerry, founded the world's first organization dedicated to protecting the rights and safety of children (Melamed & Myers, 2006). The New York Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children was born when the two men realized the need for such an organization after working together on a court case (Melamed & Myers, 2006). The results of this case removed nine-year-old Mary Ellen from her home, having suffered severe physical abuse and neglect (Melamed & Myers, 2006). This later led to the creation of many other private organizations committed to protecting children's safety. Throughout the 1960's and 1970's many laws were created that became the steppingstones to a federal government led organization focused on the same goals (Melamed & Myers, 2006). The federal Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act of 1974 provided funds dedicated to state laws preventing child abuse and maltreatment, but it wasn't until 1976 that every state in the United States had these laws in place (Bergman, A.B., 2010; Melamed & Myers, 2006). Because each state determines its own child protection laws, definitions of abuse and the actions that result from a report being made vary from state to state (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). States also vary greatly in identifying which individuals and professionals are classified as mandated reporters (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). When mandated reporting laws were first written, only a handful of states included teachers (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). It wasn't until 1977 that nearly every state in the United States included teachers as mandated reporters (Nguyen-Vu, 2018).



### **Child Protection Services Today**

There have been many factors that influenced how CPS functions as the system has grown over time. Awareness of the signs of abuse as well as mandated reporting laws have changed the standard picture of what one may look for in an abused child; instances of physical abuse are becoming less frequent, while neglect reports currently make up nearly 75% of CPS cases (Bergman, 2010). One study focused on children ages four to eight years who were found to be at risk for abuse and neglect and compared those who had received CPS services to those who had not, and the results showed no distinguishable difference between the two groups (Bergman, A. B., 2010). Those children who had received services had no noticeable changes in a variety of areas including child behavioral issues, maternal education, family functioning and poverty, or social support, which suggests that the CPS interventions they received took no effect on the families (Bergman, 2010).

Research has also shown there to be a disproportionate number of children of color involved in CPS cases than white children in the United States (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). Data shows that low-income families of color are much more likely to be reported for instances of abuse or neglect and are also more likely to be taken on as a case within the CPS system (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). Researchers offer up a comparison of two mothers who made similar parenting choices in regard to the supervision of their nine-year-old children and were treated in vastly different ways (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). One parent allowed her daughter to play in a nearby park alone while working at a minimum wage job (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). This parent could not afford childcare. The other parent was a journalist who wrote an article on allowing her son to ride the subway home alone (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). Both mothers made choices about children, who were the same age, that led to the children being unsupervised for an

extended period of time (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). The journalist, a white woman, was regarded as being forward thinking, while the mother who could not afford childcare, an African-American woman, was reported to CPS, received jail time, and nearly lost her job as a result (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). This incident is a prime example of how a person's personal bias may have impact on the decision to report a child to CPS; not all situations may be considered and reported equally by mandated reporters.

### **Mandated Reporters**

As a part of the guidelines laid out by CAPTA, all states are required to identify persons responsible for reporting potential occurrences of child abuse, known as mandated reporters (Children's Bureau, 2019a). Each state varies in their descriptions of who is a mandated reporter, but the majority of states include teachers, childcare providers, health care workers, social workers, mental health professionals, and law enforcement officers in their mandate (Children's Bureau, 2019a). Other common professionals identified as reporters include photograph processors, parole officers, volunteers or employees providing any type of organized youth activity, animal control workers, computer technicians, and higher education employees (Children's Bureau, 2019a). The variation in state's determination of who is a mandated reporter is one of the clearest distinctions in how child abuse laws and regulations can vary from state to state. For example, while 28 states in the United States identify members of clergy as mandated reporters, Minnesota specifies that ministers are only reporters when the information was reported while working or providing ministerial support (Children's Bureau, 2019a). 18 states specify that any person who suspects abuse is mandated to report, whereas Rhode Island only identifies healthcare workers as individuals charged with this responsibility (Children's Bureau, 2019a).

Hospitals, schools, or other organizations that employ mandated reporters may have individual rules and regulations regarding the reporting process (Children's Bureau, 2019a). When a mandated reporter is making a report using an internal process where the head of an organization may be making the report on the individual's behalf, this is known as institutional reporting (Children's Bureau, 2019a). Some states specify in their mandated reporting laws that employers are not to discourage employees from making reports, or that employees are not to incur any type of disciplinary action in the workplace if they chose to file a report (Children's Bureau, 2019a). These types of laws only exist in less than half of the states in the U.S., which can cause mandated reporters to seriously consider whether or not to make a report (Children's Bureau, 2019a).

### **Reporting Process**

Research found that the decision to report a family to CPS is not one taken lightly by educators or other reporting professionals. Research has shown that teachers may not report child abuse for a variety of reasons: the fear of that the reports will be inaccurate; fear that there will be negative consequences for making a report; are worried about cultural misunderstandings with the family; do not have a full understanding of how to properly report abuse (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). Research has also shown that teachers' emotions and connections with children also play an important part in the decision to make a CPS report, and fears of what effects a CPS investigation could have on a family were the teachers choose to make a report (Nguyen-Vu, 2018). While teachers may struggle with the decision-making process about if a report is warranted, it is also important to consider that there are legal consequences as well if a report is not made (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016; Nguyen-Vu, 2018). Failure to report a case of child abuse could result in the loss of a license to work in a professional capacity or other legal repercussions

(Krase, n.d.). Waiting too long or choosing not to report a case is determined to be “willful failure” and can lead to criminal penalties that vary depending on the severity of the type of abuse involved (Krase, n.d.). There are many professionals who are required to make reports, and failure to do so may also result in a loss of license to work in the failed reporters professional capacity (Krase, n.d.). While the results for failing to report child abuse can be severe, it is very seldom that any prosecution is brought to those who fail to comply with mandated reporting laws (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016).

### **Conclusion**

Research analyzed for this paper revealed that 44% of the 4.3 million referrals made to CPS in 2018 were not considered for services (Children’s Bureau, 2018). The lack of services was due to not obtaining enough information to warrant consideration, the referral was not determined to be an abusive situation, CPS was not the appropriate agency to handle the reported situation, or the children in the report were over the age of 18 (Children’s Bureau, 2018). While CPS may have determined that those 44% are not in need of services, there is a possibility that those children and families would benefit from some type of intervention to improve their well-being and increase the chances of having a successful future. Research shows that early intervention practices provide lasting effects on a child’s health and well-being, the first five years of a child’s life being the optimal time to establish healthy life practices (Lung, Tsang, & Heung, 2013). This leads to the topic that will be explored throughout this paper, the question of is CPS and effective system, and how can early childhood educators work to prevent instances of abuse.

## **Chapter 2: Literature Review**

There are many factors at play when considering what causes abuse and the best ways to serve a family experiencing abuse. Socio-economic status, homelessness, and access to quality early childhood education programs can all play an important part in what causes an instance of child abuse to occur (Henschel, de Bruin, & Möhler, 2014). As noted in the previous chapter, each state varies in their determination of what constitutes as abuse, and therefore it is important to note that the abuse response can vary from state to state as well. Determining the most effective methods for addressing families in abusive situations is vital to a child's development. Children's brain development is occurring most rapidly in early childhood, and childhood maltreatment can have damaging chemical effects on a child's brain development (American Human Association, Center for the Study of Social Policy, Child Welfare League of America, Children's Defense Fund, & Zero to Three, 2011). Just as a child's brain is can be damaged the most at an early age, intervention to correct these negative effects also must occur at an early age. In a 2019 study, researchers found that children who experienced maltreatment were at an elevated risk for arrest as an adult due to lower levels of cognitive flexibility, executive functioning skills, and nonverbal reasoning (Nikulina & Widom). These findings show that providing as much support as possible to prevent occurrences and reoccurrences of abusive and neglectful situations is critical to a child's development.

### **Factors that Influence Child Abuse**

To understand what the best methods are for preventing abuse, it is first important to understand what factors increase the likelihood of childhood abuse. In a 2019 case-control study, researchers examined if socioeconomic factors had a link to child neglect cases (Turner, Vanderminden, Finkelhor, & Hamby). Information was taken from the 2011 and 2014 reports of

the National Survey of Children's Exposure to Violence which includes data collection on child abuse and neglect cases for children ages 2-17 years old (Turner et al., 2019). Interviews were conducted with caregivers and one child in the household to obtain more demographic information about families chosen to participate in the study, were paid \$20 for participation, and were given the option of being interviewed in either English or Spanish (Turner et al., 2019). Interviewers were trained in how to respond to any disclosure of victimization that may occur, and participants who shared any such information were connected with counseling support (Turner et al., 2019).

Results of the study showed that parents with less than a high school education were twice as likely to participate in acts of supervisory neglect compared to parents with a college education, but no link was found between parent education and other forms of abuse (Turner et al., 2019). Household income showed no link between any forms of abuse, however interviews showed that perceived financial strain on the part of caregivers did have an association with acts of physical abuse (Turner et al., 2019). Parental or caregiver history of job loss showed significant associations across all forms of abuse compared to those whose employment histories were more consistent (Turner et al., 2019). Findings also showed that the rates of physical neglect were very similar between older and younger children, and rates of supervisory neglect were much higher for older children (Turner et al., 2019). These findings suggest that while Child Protective Services (CPS) statistics tend to show higher rates of neglect and abuse among younger children, it is possible that in reality, the numbers may be much more similar due to the fact that cases with younger children tend to be reported more than those involving older children (Turner et al., 2019). Researchers also discussed how this study was limited in the fact that neglect is a difficult thing to assess and track with a uniform set of measures and because of

this, it is possible for cases of neglect to be underreported to CPS (Turner et al., 2019). Another limitation to the study may have occurred in bias from the participants, as all participants were offered a monetary incentive for participating in the study (Turner et al., 2019).

In addition to socioeconomic status, whether or not parents experienced abuse as a child can have an effect on the likelihood to abuse a child. Researchers assessed 87 mothers of preschool children using the Childhood Trauma Questionnaire which provides ratings for different types of abuse that one may have experienced (Henschel et al., 2014). The mothers with high scores in areas of sexual or physical abuse were considered for the study, and those with low scores in the same area were used as a control group (Henschel et al., 2014). Participants were also given a Self-Control Scale and Child Abuse Potential Inventory questionnaires to rate the participants self-control abilities and child abuse potential respectively (Henschel et al., 2014). The children of the mothers participating in the study were given the Effortful Control Battery test to assess the children's self-regulation skills and gain insight into the parenting styles and educational demands of the mothers (Henschel et al., 2014).

Results of this cross-sectional study showed that mothers who experienced childhood abuse were significantly more likely to abuse a child than the control group, despite parenting intentions (Henschel et al., 2014). Researchers also hypothesized that mothers' self-control abilities would be reflected in children's self-regulation skills, but the results did not strongly support this theory and more research would need to be done on this relationship (Henschel et al., 2014). Additional results that were obtained during this study and not previously hypothesized by researchers showed that older children had higher self-regulation scores than younger children and working mothers had higher self-control scores compared to non-working mothers (Henschel et al., 2014). Single mothers were also shown to be at a higher risk of abuse

acts compared to mothers in a relationship (Henschel et al., 2014). Limitations of this study include the need for improved measures of self-control in children, as well as the need to focus on older children to be able to fully understand the importance of developing these skills in early childhood (Henschel et al., 2014).

### **Effectiveness of the Current System in the United States**

There is a body of research in the United States that indicates the introduction of support services to families do not have an impact on the recurrences of child maltreatment instances within that family (Russell, Kerwin, & Halverson, 2018). It is difficult to discern what factors affect these cases, but one such study reported that a child who receives services is up to 35% more likely to be reported a second time (Russell et al., 2018). Kang conducted a study in 2018 to determine if the services a family received as a result of a CPS case matched the needs of the family as well as to explore the impact those services had on the families. 373 guardians from the Illinois CPS system were interviewed by phone and asked questions regarding what type of services were received, what emotional support was provided, whether the services they received adequately met the families' needs, and how those services had an effect on the family's perceived levels of stress (Kang, 2018). These factors were chosen for this process-model study as researchers identified past studies to be lacking in this area of research (Kang, 2018). The families that participated in the study voluntarily chose to participate upon completing an exit survey at the completion of their CPS services and were offered a \$15 Walmart gift card for completing the survey (Kang, 2018). All families that participated were reported to CPS for instances of neglect and of these families, over 90% were female, more than 50% had some college or higher education, and approximately half received an annual income of less than \$10,000 (Kang, 2018).



Results of the study showed significant indication that emotional support had a strong impact on decreasing the likelihood of child maltreatment occurrences (Kang, 2018). Results also showed that alongside this emotional support, occurrences also decreased when caregiver's levels of perceived stress aligned with the services received that allowed for the feelings of a sense of control over the situation (Kang, 2018). This study was limited by including only caregivers who qualified for a specific project area of the Illinois CPS system, and voluntarily chose to participate in the study (Kang, 2018). Because of the specific population surveyed in this study, it is not possible to make generalized conclusions about all families receiving CPS services. Because participants were offered a monetary incentive for participating, this may have had an additional effect on the population of families involved with the study (Kang, 2018). This study was also limited in its use of an unstandardized unit of measurement for determining levels of emotional support and perceived match of received services, and it is suggested that better units of measurement be used for these areas in future studies (Kang, 2018).

Solomon and Asber (2012) also researched the effectiveness of CPS services in eliminating recurrences of abuse, also known as recidivism. Archival data from CPS case files were used in this cohort study, using only studies in which abuse was conclusively determined to have occurred (Solomon & Asber, 2012). All cases chosen occurred between 2007 and 2008 in the southern United States and were looked at by family units rather than by individual children (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Researchers considered data such as the amount of time between CPS cases, child and parent characteristics such as age, gender, and relationship status, type of abuse, and situational characteristics such as number of children in the household, or presence of alcohol or substance abuse (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Types of interventions received from

social services were also considered when reviewing data and assessing results (Solomon & Asber, 2012).

Results of this study showed that 50.8% of cases experienced recidivism following an abuse or neglect report to CPS (Solomon & Asber, 2012). When broken down among the different types of reports, neglect cases experienced a reoccurrence of abuse in 53.2% of cases, physical abuse recurred in 44.4% of cases, and domestic violence experienced recidivism in 55.7% of cases (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Children who were given out of home placements away from parents for a period of time were significantly more likely to experience a second occurrence of abuse (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Researchers suggest that following a family for longer periods of time post-reunification may bring about a positive impact in reducing the likelihood of abuse for out of home placement situations (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Results of the study also showed that parents that were provided therapy had a noticeably lower rate of recidivism, which suggests that providing support for psychological problems such as stress and depression may have an impact on occurrences of child maltreatment (Solomon & Asber, 2012). Limitations of this study can be found in the limited sample size available, and the use of archival data meant the researchers did not have input on which data and interventions were to be used for the study (Solomon & Asber, 2012). A final limitation occurs in the demographic of the participants, as the majority of the sample used were of Caucasian descent, and therefore generalizations cannot be made about other populations of families (Solomon & Asber, 2012).

In another case report study of the CPS system, Russell et al. (2018) discuss that the perceived ineffectiveness of the interventions made may be affected by over-reporting, leading to an alarming workload, and under-reporting of cases that are of a legitimate concern. Researchers studied cases that occurred in between July 1, 2010 and June 30, 2011 (Russell et al., 2018). If

families had more than one case, the first reported case was used in this study (Russell et al., 2018). Cases that were included in the study had been reported to CPS, were screened for in-person investigation, a substantial report was determined, and was opened for post-investigation services (Russell et al., 2018). All cases required a pre- and post-services risk-assessment evaluation which the researchers then studied the scores of to determine if CPS services had an effect on the likelihood of abuse reoccurrence (Russell et al., 2018). Researchers were then able to sort cases into four comparable groups of high-risk families. The first group one group was provided recommendation to be opened for services by following policy recommendations and the second group was not recommended (Russell et al., 2018). The third and fourth groups were structured similarly, but for cases in which workers had not followed policy recommendations (Russell et al., 2018).

Researchers compared the groups using various methods and controls to determine if opening a case and providing services had a direct effect upon the likelihood of further maltreatment cases and determined there was no relationship found (Russell et al., 2018). Researchers also discussed that when focusing on certain aspects of a CPS response, families who interact with response workers that provide emotional support were more likely to have support needs met, and the decreased stress level led to a decrease in recurrences of maltreatment (Russell et al., 2018). This suggests that more research including these variables must be done to truly understand the effects of CPS services has on high-risk families (Russell et al., 2018). Limitations were also found in that researchers were able to compare cases that were similar in type but were unable to further investigate why certain decisions were made, the experience level of the workers involved and if that impacted the decisions made, or the quality of services provided (Russell et al., 2018). Researchers further speculate that due to the fact that the majority

of cases pertain to neglect rather than abuse this could have had an impact on the overall results (Russell et al., 2018).

### **Parent Perceptions**

In a 2006 study, researchers interviewed parents who had worked with CPS about experiences parents had with the investigation process (Palmer, Maiter, & Manji). Parents were recruited from two CPS agencies in mid-sized cities in Ontario, Canada, and were randomly selected to be asked to participate (Palmer et al., 2006). Parents who chose to participate were interviewed in a semi-structured manner in the family's own home and answers were both audiotaped and transcribed by research assistants (Palmer et al., 2006). Of the 61 families participating in the study, only one interview was conducted with both a mother and father present, the remaining 60 interviews were done by only one parent: 57 and three mothers and fathers respectively (Palmer et al., 2006). While data about families income or financial situation were not collected, many families commented about financial strain during the interview (Palmer et al., 2006). Broad questions were asked encompassing information about the family's daily lives, involvement with CPS, and the results of the interaction had with CPS; if parents chose to discuss additional topics researchers did not redirect the topic of conversation (Palmer et al., 2006). Interviews were reviewed once completed and themes were identified, such as parent views of helpful and unhelpful CPS interventions and the natures of parents' daily lives (Palmer et al., 2006).

Results of this study were broken down into two categories. The first discussed the positive support families received from CPS workers. When asked to reflect on positive interactions, parents reported having received necessary help with emotional support and concrete help with finding appropriate services such as childcare, counselling, treatment centers,

or psychological assessment as most helpful (Palmer et al., 2006). Parents reported being grateful for workers who were non-judgmental when listening to the parents' feelings about the situation and providing useful feedback to address the problems and concerns that were expressed (Palmer et al., 2006). Parents also reported that CPS workers who showed respect towards the parents and provided choices in how to move forward with the intervention process also aided in having had a significantly positive impact on the parent's CPS experience (Palmer et al., 2006).

The second area explored in the results of this exploratory, qualitative study were the negative experiences parents had with CPS, including harassment, unfair treatment, inadequate services, and traumatizing removal of children from the home (Palmer et al., 2006). Parents expressed frustration in situations where help was requested and the received services that did not meet the parent's needs, or parents ineligible or had to wait to receive services (Palmer et al., 2006). One mother recalled a situation in which she called wanting help and stated that she was going to hurt her child and did not know how to keep herself under control (Palmer et al., 2006). The only help that this mother received in this situation was a few phone numbers, and the mother further commented that, "If you weren't beating your kid they didn't have time for you" (Palmer et al., 2006, p. 817). Parents also expressed difficulty in receiving aid for children with special needs, and communication with workers was difficult as well (Palmer et al., 2006). One parent reported surprise that upon the return of her children to her home, a CPS worker did not visit the home or check in with the family for five months following the children's return (Palmer et al., 2006). Other parents reported feeling criticized or judged by workers, and high turnover between workers on their case made them feel depersonalized and misled or betrayed by the withholding of information about children taken from the home (Palmer et al., 2006).

Overall, the implications of this study show a need for emotional support during CPS investigations. While this study provided much insight into parents' perceptions of the CPS process, it is limited in the demographic of the participants due to the location chosen for research (Palmer et al., 2006). This also limits the transferability of the results to other populations (Palmer et al., 2006). One final limitation was present in the participants, as the majority of interviewees were mothers, and female and male perceptions may vary, as may the perceptions of couples when interviewed together.

### **Child Abuse Interventions**

Current research shows that children whose parents are involved in their education are more likely to graduate from high school, have better attendance records, more positive mental and emotional health, and better academic achievement (Oakes, Maier, & Daniel, 2017). Research that identifies effective methods for promoting these outcomes is necessary in decreasing the chances of childhood maltreatment. Parent education and home visits are two of the most common methods for preventing child abuse and neglect cases, while other proven methods will also be discussed.

### **Parent Education**

In 2016, Ansari and Gershoff researched the effectiveness that the parent involvement component of Head Start programs had on parents and children. Children who had participated in a Head Start program at ages three and four were chosen for this program and were also required to keep the same chosen evaluation language over the two years studied (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Children were chosen from classrooms in centers across the United States to give a wide, national sized sample (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). The majority of parent respondents for the study identified themselves to be the mother of the child participating, one-

third of which had less than a high school education and 44% of which were unemployed (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Surveys were completed by parents, caregivers, teachers, and center directors regarding information such as teacher and staff training, involvement support and obstacles, parent involvement and discipline strategies, children behavior problems and approaches to learning, and the children's literacy and math skills (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016).

Data was then evaluated, and researchers found that intervention with parents may have long-term positive effects on a child's development (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Teacher and staff training in parent involvement showed to have a positive impact on parent involvement rates within the center (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Research also showed that while parent involvement did not take effect on changes with children behavior, it did have positive effects on parenting behavior (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). The reasons why parents may not be involved with the parent outreach programs were also considered, and it was noted that issues such as scheduling conflicts with work or other children's activities have a large impact on the involvement of parents in a young child's development (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). This longitudinal study was limited in that since only children with a consistent language preference were chosen, minority and dual-language speakers were likely not included in the sample for this study (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Using parent reports also limited the researchers, as researchers only considered overall involvement rather than specific types of involvement (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016). Researchers also did not take into consideration cultural climates of centers or other existing parent involvement factors that may have been in place before the study began that could have had an impact on results (Ansari & Gershoff, 2016).

Graybill et al. (2016) also conducted a similar study in 2016, focusing on low-income families with children at centers within the research area. Children were given an assessment and

found to be in “at-risk” or “typical” areas of development (Graybill et al., 2016). All participants of the study identified themselves to be either ‘mother’ or ‘father,’ with 90% of the participants identifying themselves as ‘mother’ (Graybill et al, 2016). Researchers provided the parents of these families with a “Milestones Moments” booklet, developed by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention’s Learn the Signs/Early Act initiative (Graybill et al., 2016). The booklet detailed the milestones children should reach in development, signs of concern, and activities parents can do with children at home (Graybill et al, 2016). Along with the booklet, parents participated in six weeks of home-visits focused on educating parents about child interactions and development (Graybill et al, 2016). Families were evaluated at three points throughout the study; a Week One baseline assessment, a Week Seven post-assessment, and a Week 19 follow-up assessment (Graybill et al, 2016). Assessments were studied to determine if the intervention provided any improvement upon parent’s general knowledge of child development, the rate at which parents express concern over potential developmental delays, the rate at which a parent reaches out to a professional for information about a child’s development, and the parents’ perception of the Milestones Moments booklet that was provided (Graybill et al., 2016).

At the conclusion of this mixed method, randomized controlled trial, parents reported learning much about the different stages of child development with emphasis on how very young children vary in terms of what age children hit particular milestones (Graybill et al., 2016). Other parents in the study reporting having felt a sense of empowerment in having a greater understanding of child development, allowing parents to better advocate for their children when observing something that might be a concern (Graybill et al., 2016). Results showed a statistically significant improvement in parents’ understanding of child development, and positive perceptions of the use of the Milestones Moments booklet (Graybill et al., 2016). While



the study yielded positive results, it was not without its limitations. All children in the study were recruited from a childcare company that provided screening for all children upon program entry and referred those identified with concerns were referred to appropriate services to meet each child's developmental needs (Graybill et al., 2016). As these children were already receiving services, they were excluded from the study, thus meaning that those left participating in the study did not experience more significant or later onset delays (Graybill et al., 2016).

### **Home Visits**

In a 2017 retrospective cohort study, researchers studied children born between 2003 and 2009 that were identified to be at-risk and were eligible for the Families First Home Visiting (FFHV) program (Chartier et al.) A child was considered to be eligible for FFHV if they were in an at-risk situation as outlined by a series of factors and screening results, and age five or younger (Chartier et al., 2017). Researchers followed both families who did and did not participate in the program over a span of one to five years and took into consideration different variables such as if the child spent time in child welfare care, whether the child was ever hospitalized for injuries related to maltreatment occurrences, or if the child was considered to be below the typical developmental standard in any way (Chartier et al., 2017). Results of the study showed that children who participated in the FFHV program were 0.4% less likely to be hospitalized for maltreatment related injuries compared to peers who did not participate in the program, and the author's hypothesis that home visits have a positive effect on the likelihood of child maltreatment was supported (Chartier et al., 2017). The results highlight that children who experience maltreatment and do not receive substantial support are more likely to struggle in school, have an arrest record, or have physical or emotional health conditions (Chartier et al., 2017).

This study was limited in that researchers were not able to control for outside factors that influenced families who did not participate in the FFHV program (Chartier et al., 2017). While control families were not receiving services from FFHV, researchers were not able to account for any services that families received from other sources that may have had an impact on the results (Chartier et al., 2017). Researchers were also unable to control the length of time that families participated in the FFHV program which could allow for variability in the results as well (Chartier et al., 2017). This variability may also be found within the families themselves, as researchers cannot speculate the effects on home-visiting services for families that did not choose to participate in the program, as participation was voluntary for all families (Chartier et al., 2017).

In a 2020 study, West et al. looked at research involving families with substance exposed newborns and examined the effectiveness of interventions intended to reduce the risk of abuse. After clarifying search terms for this systematic review, researchers included studies that met a list of five points of criteria (West et al., 2020). The criteria used specified that the study was published in English, included participants of mothers with children ages 0-12 months, the study design was experimental, quasi-experimental, or pre-experimental, and the intervention used in the study was home- or community-based (West et al., 2020). Studies that were unpublished reports, included foster or adoptive parents, were non-intervention studies, were not available in a full-text format, or did not specifically study the substance exposed newborns as a participant group (West et al., 2020). Studies that did not meet the criteria were excluded from review. Of the 10,593 potential articles found, fifteen articles were chosen for review (West et al., 2020). Results of this review showed that families with substance exposed newborns may benefit from services tailored to meet specific needs had by families with substance exposed newborns, and

that this must be considered over a ‘one size fits all’ type of approach that generally occurs (West et al., 2020). Mothers and caregivers of infants have specific support needs that differ from those of preschoolers or older children and are likely to be more motivated to change their behavior during this period of time in which they are new to parenting (West et al., 2020). In the case of substance exposed newborns, substance abuse treatment that works with other intervention methods is vital to obtaining positive outcomes (West et al., 2020). This review was limited in the exclusion factors chosen when reviewing studies to include (West et al., 2020). While there were studies that met some of the criteria guidelines, those that did not specifically focus on the desired population were excluded, regardless of the potential positive results the study may have shown (West et al., 2020).

### **International Studies**

Countries outside of the United States have also conducted studies to learn how to improve parent confidence with young children, what other benefits arise from parent education, and what methods are best for doing so. In Tajikistan, a program called Getting Ready for School was developed to provide parents with activities to do at home with children in the year before children began formal schooling (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). Families who participated in the Getting Ready for School program were considered for this study and evaluated at three points of time; the first was in the fall before beginning the program, the second was in the summer once the program was completed, and the third was the summer one year later after the child had completed first grade (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). Prior to doing the activities at home with their children, parents would meet with teachers on a regular basis to discuss children’s progress and ask any questions the parents may have (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). During these regular meetings, parents reported gaining a sense of confidence and understanding about child

development, which led to parents sharing information learned with peers and family members outside of the study (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). Results of the study showed that parents gained a sense of empowerment about how children learn and had a better understanding of a caregiver's vital role in preparing a child for school (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). The community in which the Getting Ready for School Program was conducted also yielded some positive results that were noted in this study and were not anticipated by researchers prior to examining results. The program and study were conducted in the Tajik language which was not the primary language of all the participants (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). Minority families that participated reported that due to the program, minority children have gained a better understanding of the Tajik language, and children and parents alike have made new friends in the community, and these relationships would not have been made without the program (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). One limitation of the study is that the results of the study cannot be generalized for all countries that may use the Getting Ready for School Program. The program was developed for several East European countries and piloted in Tajikistan (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). More research would need to be done in other countries and communities to gain a full understanding of the positive effects of the program, and to determine if the positive results can be replicated in other communities.

Similar to the program in Tajikistan a 2013 pilot investigation conducted was in China by Lung, Tsang, and Heung and focused on providing support to preschool children's parents who were considered to be disadvantaged. This study included families of preschool children who were in single parent homes, low-income families, or were recent immigrants to the country (Lung et al., 2013). Researchers focused on what effects a home visiting program would have on children's academic development as well as behavior, dental and health practices within the

home, and changes with injury prevention (Lung et al., 2013). Lung et al. (2013) also looked at the effects the program had upon parent's stress levels and self-confidence, predicting that being provided with an opportunity for a social support system would bring about positive effects in these areas. Researchers chose to deliver the program via home visits to allow for maximum schedule flexibility with the families participating (Lung et al., 2013). Participants in the study were contacted by brochure and verbal advertisement via workers at a social services center (Lung et al., 2013). Children participating in the study were evaluated by their teachers in areas of motivation, school readiness, and academic competence prior to beginning the study and upon its completion (Lung et al., 2013). Trained parent assistants, who were recruited in a similar manner as the participants, conducted the home visits and worked with teachers to appropriately deliver the program content (Lung et al., 2013).

Results of the study showed that parent participants reported feeling less stressed, noticed fewer exhibits of negative child behaviors, and noted feelings of having a stronger support system due to the connections made with the parent assistants delivering the program (Lung et al., 2013). Children also were shown to have improved kindergarten-readiness scores, teeth brushing frequency, and were also reported to have fewer at home injuries due to parents' gained knowledge on how to prevent such occurrences (Lung et al., 2013). As this was a pilot study, researchers were limited in gaining a full understanding of the positive effects this program may have on families, and further research would need to be conducted for this purpose (Lung et al., 2013). Researchers were also limited in the use of evaluation measures, as some of the children participating in the study were younger than the recommended age range for the chosen evaluation methods (Lung et al., 2013). This study did also not take into account the effect the

children's preschool programs may take on a child's growth and development nor the impact of fathers or other significant caregivers as the focus was solely on mothers (Lung et al., 2013).

### **Effective Methods**

In a 2014 quasi-experimental study, researchers reached out to families who had been referred to and screened out of CPS in central Wisconsin (Maguire-Jack & Bowers). Families were contacted by a social worker that works in CPS and given the opportunity to participate in a community program that provides voluntary support services for families that had been reported to CPS, but no case for abuse was found (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). The community outreach program worked to prevent future cases of abuse by providing families with a variety of services that meet specific needs, such as transportation options, guidance with parenting or employment, or access to basic needs or healthcare (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Participants of this study included families who had been referred to CPS within Marathon County in Wisconsin from September 2008 to May 2014 (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Families were placed into three groups for comparison. These groups contained families who had received services from the community outreach program, families who had declined services, and families who had been waitlisted and were not contacted and offered services (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Researchers compared whether or not the families had any new CPS referrals for any type of abuse or neglect, if any new cases were opened for ongoing services, or if any out of home placements occurred (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014).

Results of this study showed that families that were accepted into the community outreach program had significantly lower rates of new referrals or new out of home placements (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). These results stayed consistent when compared to families who chose not to participate in the program as well (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). This suggests

cost savings for the county as there are less out of home placement, medical, and court costs to pay for with less instances of abuse occurring (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Findings also suggest the potential to have fewer families on the wait-list and lower numbers of cases reported were the community program to hire additional staff to meet the needs of all cases referred to the program (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Limitations of this study include the nature of the control group chosen for the study. The control group was chosen from those families who were wait-listed for the community program, and therefore were not chosen at random (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014). Researchers were also limited in their small sample sizes and the data available, and more research would need to be conducted that addresses these limitations (Maguire-Jack & Bowers, 2014).

Similar to the community action program focused on by Maguire-Jack and Bowers, researchers Baggett et al. (2014) focused on the effectiveness a technology-based intervention program has on decreasing the risk of child maltreatment. Low-income English and Spanish speaking mothers of infants were chosen to participate from early-intervention service providers to participate in this randomized controlled trial (Baggett et al., 2014). Researchers chose an Internet-based, remote coaching intervention program called Baby-Net, which was adapted from the in-home PALS program (Baggett et al., 2014). Mothers and infants participated in 11 sessions which included time devoted to self-directed learning, creating an action plan to practice the learned skills, a five-minute video-recorded practice of mothers interacting with infants using the skills learned, and a 30-minute video call with a coach to review the videos made by the mothers to provide feedback and support (Baggett et al., 2014). Pre- and post-assessments were taken to evaluate maternal, infant, and family characteristics and behavior, conducted via two-hour home visit sessions (Baggett et al., 2014).

Results of the study showed that when comparing low- and high-risk mothers, there was no significant difference in their level of engagement with the Baby-Net program, while high-risk mothers showed a larger increase in positive parents behavior (Baggett et al., 2014). High-risk mothers also showed a large reduction in the potential for child abuse during post-assessment evaluations (Baggett et al., 2014). No significant findings occurred when comparing the mother's satisfaction with the Baby-Net program (Baggett et al., 2014). While this study yielded positive results for using an internet-based intervention program, it was not without its limitations. This study encompassed an efficacy trial of the Baby-Net program, and more research would need to be done to obtain the full scope of its effects (Baggett et al., 2014). The use of research-based coaches to provide support to the mothers participating in the study may also have taken an effect on the results, as community program workers may not have access to the same types of training were the study to be replicated (Baggett et al., 2014). One final aspect that limits the use of the Baby-Net program is that the program is limited to those with access to a computer and internet access or a smartphone and reliable cell service (Baggett et al., 2014). While this did not affect the present study as wireless capable laptops were provided for all participants, it is an issue that may likely come about with those attempting to replicate the study or referring families to the Baby-Net program (Baggett et al., 2014).

A 2020 randomized clinical trial set out to determine if preventative interventions had an effect on compliance in children who had been referred to CPS (Lind, Bernard, Yarger, & Dozier). Children younger than two years old who were living with a biological parent following CPS involvement were recruited to participate in the study (Lind et al., 2020). Further inclusion criteria outlined that children must be participating in a city program intended to divert children from foster care (Lind et al., 2020). Both the research and control groups participated in ten



home visit sessions that were similar in duration and structure (Lind et al., 2020). The experimental intervention aimed to increase parent sensitivity and nurturing behavior and decrease parents' frightening behavior with the help of parent coaches (Lind et al., 2020). Parents were also provided with research and videos that reenforced the intended behavioral outcomes and in the moment feedback was provided during the sessions to aid parents in understanding parental behavior towards children (Lind et al., 2020). The control intervention focused on promoting children's cognitive, language, and motor skills, and parent coaches worked to teach parents how to best help children in reaching the desired milestone for a particular skill (Lind et al., 2020). Video feedback was used in the control intervention as well to discuss with parents the skills that children gained during the interventions. Post-intervention, home visit assessments occurred prior to the start of the study at one month after the interventions were complete and yearly until the child turned 48 months old (Lind et al., 2020).

Researchers compared aspects of parent sensitivity and child compliance and compared the results of the one month and 36-month assessments (Lind et al., 2020). The experimental intervention group showed significantly higher rates of parent sensitivity at the one-month assessment mark, however by the 36-month assessment the gap between the control was notable but no longer statistically significant (Lind et al., 2020). When comparing the groups on rates of child compliance, three indicators were measured: whether or not a child touched the presented toys, the overall amount of time children touched the presented toys, and the latency to the child touching the toys (Lind et al., 2020). Both the one-month and 36-month results showed that the children in the experimental intervention group were less likely to touch the presented toys and spent less time touching them over the control group peers (Lind et al., 2020). While the results

of the study proved the researchers hypothesis, the study was limited by the lack of pre-assessment data to compare the results to (Lind et al., 2020).

### **Conclusion**

Research has shown that many factors contributing to child maltreatment are problems that can be solved if a family is provided the appropriate and necessary services. When families are not provided the services needed, or encounter difficulties when reaching out for support, the risk of abuse is elevated. Community programs that address issues such as poverty, homelessness, employment strain, and mental health needs aid parents in obtaining the support necessary to care for themselves and children. Studies have also shown that CPS oftentimes does not adequately provide the appropriate services parents are in need of or that the services are not executive in an effective manner. Alongside the problems that occur with the effectiveness of CPS, parents in at-risk situations often show low levels of self-control, a skill which develops in early childhood, and this indicates an increased risk to react inappropriately to stressful situations (Henschel et al., 2014). Measures to provide parents the necessary support they need, and to provide children that have experienced abuse the opportunity to develop these important skills will be discussed in the next chapter of this paper.

### **Chapter 3: Discussion**

The review of literature for this paper sought to answer the question of is Child Protective Services (CPS) effective and how can educators work to prevent instances of abuse. The Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act (CAPTA) of 1974 was created with the intent of promoting the prevention of child abuse and separated the work of maltreatment prevention into its own jurisdiction (Meiners & Tolliver, 2016). Previously paired with anti-poverty programs, researchers Meiners and Tolliver (2016) argue that “with CAPTA, children’s wellbeing was policed, but not supported, and all the structural factors that shape child welfare, including, for example, parent’s income, were rendered invisible” (p. 108). Research into the effectiveness of the current CPS system show that services are successful only if particular circumstances occur. Meiners and Tolliver’s argument towards the necessity of addressing all factors that influence a child’s wellbeing is supported in the positive results yielded from studies investigating the effectiveness of home visits and parent education interventions.

#### **Insights Gained from Research**

Research into the effectiveness of parent education and home visits as a tool for supporting at-risk families showed results that aligned positively with studies that investigated effective methods in preventing recurrences of child maltreatment. Parent perceptions of experiences receiving these types of services also reflected positively with the effects of the studies discussed. In addition to discussing the insights gained from the research analyzed, suggestions for improvements to the existing CPS system are made as well.

#### **Parent Education and Home Visits as a Tool**

Samuels (2013) shares perspectives of teen parents of young children who participated in home visits, and the overwhelming response was that after participating in the visits, teen

mothers felt a greater sense of calmness when dealing with frustrating behaviors having obtained a better understanding of how the behavior was necessary to a child's development. Furthermore, these parents were also more capable of succeeding in school, grew in their feelings of empowerment, and were able to go from being in a low-income household situation to being in a financially stable environment (Samuels, 2013). Samuels' (2013) interviews with teen mothers highlights what research in the previous chapter supports, which is that parent education is important and necessary to the prevention of instances of child maltreatment. Samuels (2013) also highlights a key factor to the importance of parent education during an interview with a teacher. In this interview, the teacher states that she is only with the child for a small amount of time during the day while the rest of the day is up to the parents (Samuels, 2013). Therefore, the more teachers are able to influence parents and caregivers on appropriate child development, the greater the potential for healthy development (Samuels, 2013). Studies show that using home visits and parent education as a tool to lower the risk of child maltreatment to be successful, however it is important to note that the training of staff in home visit programs may have an effect on the quality of services provided (Chartier et al., 2017). This important factor highlights the importance of providing families easy access to high quality early childhood education and parent or family support programs. As stated in the research done by Palmer, Maiter, and Manji (2006), parents attest to the benefits of being provided access to the services they need as a vital key to the effectiveness of their interactions with CPS.

### **Effectiveness of Child Protective Services**

Studies conducted by Russel, Kerwin, and Halverson (2018), Kang (2018), Solomon and Asber (2012), and Palmer et al. (2009) all report that CPS is effective when emotional support is provided to parents, and the parents feel perceived needs are being met. Russel et al. (2018)

further report that the intervention of services had no effect on child's likelihood to experience a recurrence of abuse, except in instances in which emotional support was provided. Solomon and Asber (2012) reported that children taken from homes during a CPS investigation were in fact more likely to be victims a second time. However, when parents participated in therapy sessions families were found to be less likely to be involved in a second case of maltreatment (Solomon & Asber, 2012). This research suggests that the current CPS model in itself is ineffective in preventing occurrences and reoccurrences of child maltreatment unless there is evidence of quality emotional support provided to the parents and caregivers involved.

### **Recommendations for Improved Effectiveness**

Based upon the results of research reviewed for this paper, there are several suggestions for improvements to the CPS system. The first set of recommendations are related to the staff working in CPS. Improvements to the training requirements for workers interacting directly with families to ensure the families receive appropriate care is one of the most important issues identified by parents (Palmer et al., 2006). CPS workers must have the capability to be non-judgmental in any situation encountered and to view circumstances from the parent's point of view. Case workers must also have flexibility when working with families to provide services that meet the parent's needs and have a working knowledge of appropriate community resources available to recommend to families.

In addition to addressing improvements for staff, CPS as an organization has areas in which improvements could be made as well. Improving relationships with community organizations that aim to provide support for at-risk families may lead to more families receiving necessary support, regardless of if an investigation is made. Creating relationships with other organizations in the community where mandated reporters work may also lead to greater

understanding of what being a mandated reporter means, but more research would need to be done to evaluate this relationship. CPS generally comes with the stigma of negativity; the work that is done in the organization is to take children away from bad parents. Working with the public to promote the valuable work CPS does to support families and provide them with services to aid families in improving quality of life may aid in parent's perceptions of CPS and may lead to less stressful encounters. While all of these improvements may lead to more productive encounters between CPS and families, none of it is possible without funding. Allocating the funds needed for CPS offices to have an optimal number of staff and the time and resources for sufficient training is a necessity to allow for an effective and efficient organization.

### **Addressing and Advocating for Children's Rights**

Just as early childhood educators have the enormous responsibility of caring for children and being mindful of and reporting suspected abuse, teachers are also accountable for setting children up for future success. Teaching children self-regulation and coping skills in early childhood will provide children a good foundation for learning and development in the years to come. In addition to this, understanding a child's rights and knowing how to best support a children and families in a difficult situation are key skills that every early childhood educator must be equip with.

### **Social-Emotional Learning**

Often overlooked in favor of a strong math and literacy focus, social-emotional learning is the key component to a child's future educational success. Dr. Becky Bailey (2013) developed the Conscious Discipline behavior model to address the need for positive social-emotional learning in the classroom, and to help children living in stressful situations to be more successful. This research-based program focuses on changing how educators can approach discipline in a

way that also teaches children positive core values that shape the way they view the world around them. Some of the values taught in Conscious Discipline include the understanding that a person is able to make individual own decisions and make personality changes, that a person is responsible for actions and those actions have consequences, and that mistakes and conflict are an opportunity to learn and grow (Bailey, 2014). Research shows that the use of Conscious Discipline improves the quality of interactions between students and teachers, reduces aggression, improves social-emotional behavior of both students and teachers, decreases impulsivity and hyperactivity, and enhances the effectiveness of parenting skills (Bailey, 2014). Parents of children in Conscious Discipline classrooms report positive feelings towards their school community, “even when they do not feel safe where they live” (Bailey, 2014, p. 18).

To further support Dr. Bailey’s logic of teaching children appropriate social-emotional skills, Dr. Todd May, professor of Philosophy at Clemson University, argues that teaching children about morals and philosophy is a necessity. In an interview in which he was asked how early was too early to start teaching children these concepts, his response was “too early is before they can speak, any time after that is fine” (Jackson, 2020). As children grow and develop, questions are posed about why things are the way they are to create a frame of reference for how the world around them functions. It is the job of early childhood educators to aid children in creating this frame of reference and teach them the basic concepts of moral philosophy. Adult brains are wired to revert back to the reactions learned from key authority figures as a child (Conscious Discipline, 2020). If early childhood educators make a deliberate effort to teach children the basics of moral philosophy and appropriate self-regulation skills, children will have a better chance of success in the future if met with challenging situations.

### **Advocacy for Children**

While social-emotional learning has the potential to provide large amounts of support to children, there may still come a time when an educator faces the decision of if a report to CPS is necessary. Educators must be armed with the knowledge of the responsibilities of a mandated reporter and be familiar with, and able to recognize the signs of abuse in young children. If training opportunities are not readily available, educators must also take personal responsibility to seek out resources to learn how to approach conversations with children and parents in circumstances where there is suspect of abuse or neglect. Building relationships with parents, and being able to recognize the signs of poverty, homelessness, or financial straining alongside with being familiar with community support programs to share with families is another way that educators can actively work to prevent occurrences of child maltreatment.

### **Future Studies**

While there is much positive research into effective methods to prevent occurrences of child abuse more research must be done to be able to gain a full understanding of how to best promote effective utilization of CPS services. Research to determine if the current provided funding towards CPS meets the actual needs of services that must be provided is necessary to understand how much work is necessary to advocate for additional resources. In addition to researching the funding needs of CPS, training opportunities provided to staff must also be addressed. Studies focused on what types of trainings provide the skills necessary to be effective supporters for families and advocates for children will help to identify what is lacking in the current system and what areas need improvement. Another suggested study is the investigation of conscious pairing of CPS workers to particular age groups or types of abuse to promote more positive interactions with families. By pairing CPS workers that are experts working with certain



ages of children or types of abuse it can be hypothesized there is potential for more successful interventions as the workers will have specialized knowledge of the best methods to support families in specific situations.

Another suggestion is to further investigate mandated reporters definitions of abuse and neglect. As discussed in a doctoral dissertation by Nguyen-Vu (2018), educators vary greatly in personal definitions of what constitutes as abuse or neglect. Research that investigates ways to negate the disparity in definitions of maltreatment may have impacts of the rates of over- or under-reporting of abuse by mandated reporters. A final suggestion for future research is to continue evaluating parent perceptions of the CPS system and their involvement with CPS services. By researching parent's experiences and views on the effectiveness of the interactions had with CPS, evaluations for changes to the effectiveness of the system can better fit the needs of the families the system aims to benefit. In addition, understanding parent's perceptions of CPS, both by families who are at a high or low risk of potential involvement with CPS, workers will have a better understanding of the preexisting expectations parents and caregivers have regarding the actions CPS takes. Obtaining an understanding of parent perceptions of the system, case workers will more easily be able to empathize with families and establish a positive connection during an investigation.

### **Conclusion**

Childhood abuse has the potential to incur lifelong impacts upon its victims. Children who experience abuse may experience developmental, cognitive, or emotional delays and are more likely to become perpetrators of abuse as adults (Children's Bureau, 2019b). There are approximately 26 different reported interventions as a response towards child maltreatment, and among those researched to be successful include home visits, parent education, and emotional

support, (Children's Bureau, 2018; Graybill et al., 2016; Kang, 2018; Solomon & Asber, 2012). International studies have also shown to have positive results with parent education interventions in providing parents with a sense of confidence about child development, leading to healthier parent-child relationships and the unintended consequence of the sharing of information about child development between adult peers (Whitsel & Lapham, 2014). In addition to understanding the most effective methods for preventing occurrences or recurrences of child maltreatment, parents and CPS workers must establish a trusting relationship to ensure the needs of families are being met and resulting in a positive outcome of an investigation (Palmer et al., 2006). Future studies are essential to the continued improvement of the current CPS system, to guarantee that all children have an equal opportunity for healthy development. Educators, especially those working within an early childhood capacity, must be informed of the knowledge of signs of abuse and responsibilities of a mandated reporter. Children undergo an immense amount of cognitive development in early childhood, and quality care from both educators and parents is essential to establish a positive framework for development. Positive interventions in situations of abuse are necessary to allow children the greatest prospect possible for healthy development. Changes to the current CPS system must be made to ensure that children and families are provided the support necessary to ensure that all children are provided the opportunity to grow into functioning members of society and lessen occurrences of abuse and neglect.

### References

- American Humane Association, Center for the Study of Social Policy, Child Welfare League of America, Children's Defense Fund, & Zero to Three (2011). A call to action on the behalf of maltreated children. *Zero to Three*. Retrieved from <https://www.zerotothree.org/resources/454-a-call-to-action-on-behalf-of-maltreated-infants-and-toddlers>
- Ansari, A. & Gershoff, E. (2016). Parent involvement in Head Start and children's development: indirect effects through parenting. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 78(4), 562-579.
- Bailey, B. A. (2014). *Conscious Discipline: Building resilient classrooms*. Loving Guidance, Inc.
- Baggett, K., Davis, B., Feil, E., Sheeber, L., Landry, S., Leve, C., & Johnson, U. (2017). A randomized controlled trial examination of a remote parenting intervention: Engagement and effects on parenting behavior and child abuse potential. *Child Maltreatment*, 22(4), 315-323.
- Bergman, A.B. (2010). Child Protection Services has outlived its usefulness. *Archives of Pediatrics & Adolescent Medicine*, 164(10), 978-979.
- Chartier, M. J., Brownell, M. D., Isaac, M. R., Chateau, D., Nickel, N. C., Katz, A., Sarkar, J., Hu, M., & Taylor, C. (2017). Is the Families First Home Visiting program effective in reducing child maltreatment and improving child development? *Child Maltreatment*, 22(2), 121-131.
- Childhelp (n.d.). *The issue of child abuse*. Childhelp National Child Abuse Hotline. <https://www.childhelp.org/child-abuse/>
- Children's Bureau (2018). *Child Maltreatment 2018*. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <https://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/cb/cm2018.pdf>
- Children's Bureau (2019a). *Mandatory Reporters of Child Abuse and Neglect*. Child Welfare

- Information Gateway. <https://www.childwelfare.gov/pubPDFs/manda.pdf>
- Children's Bureau (2019b). *What is child abuse and neglect? Recognizing the signs and symptoms*. Child Welfare Information Gateway. <https://www.childwelfare.gov/pubPDFs/whatiscan.pdf>
- Conscious Discipline (2020). *The Conscious Discipline brain state model*. Conscious Discipline. <https://consciousdiscipline.com/methodology/brain-state-model/#brainstatemodel>
- Graybill, E., Self-Brown, S., Lai, B., Vinoski, E., McGill, T. & Crimmins, D. (2016). Addressing disparities in parent education: Examining effects of Learn the Signs/Act Early parent education materials on parent outcomes. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 44(1), 31-38.
- Henschel, S., de Bruin, M., & Möhler, E. (2014). Self-control and child abuse potential in mothers with an abuse history and their preschool children. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, 23(5), 824–836.
- Jackson, M. E. (Host). (2019, May 6). What's Good: Paul Scheer [Audio podcast episode]. In *The Good Place: The Podcast*. NBC Entertainment. <https://art19.com/shows/the-good-place-the-podcast/episodes/4989e235-6c5f-4937-9426-893a2b94fd21>
- Kang, J. (2018). The impact of in-home services from Child Protection Services on child maltreatment recurrence: a process model. *Families in Society: The Journal of Contemporary Social Services*, 96(4), 241-249.
- Krase, K. S. (n.d.). Social workers as mandated reporters: What if I don't report? Part VIII. *The New Social Worker*. Retrieved from <https://www.socialworker.com/feature-articles/Practice/social-workers-as-mandated-reporters-what-if-i-dont-report/#:~:text=A%20mandated%20reporter%20who%20fails%20to%20report%20suspected%20child%20maltreatment>,

%2C%20state%2C%20and%20local%20laws

- Leung, C., Tsang, S., & Heung, K. (2013). Pilot evaluation of a home visit parent-training program in disadvantaged families. *Research on Social Work Practice, 23*(4), 397-406.
- Lind, T., Bernard, K., Yarger, H. A., & Dozier, M. (2020). Promoting compliance in children referred to Child Protective Services: A randomized clinical trial. *Child Development, 91*(2), 563-576.
- Maguire-Jack, K. & Bowers, J. (2014). Marathon County community response: Voluntary services for families screened out of Child Protective Services. *Child Welfare, 93*(5), 65-82.
- Meiners, E. & Tolliver, C. (2016). Refusing to be complicit in our prison nation: teachers rethinking mandated reporting. *Radical Teacher, 106*, 106-114.
- Melamed, D. R., & Meyers, J. E. B. (2006). *Child protection in America: Past, present, and future*. Oxford University Press USA.
- Nikulina, V., & Widom, C. S. (2019). Higher levels of intelligence and executive functioning protect maltreated children against adult arrests: A prospective study. *Child Maltreatment, 24*(1), 3-16.
- Nguyen-Vu, MyTra Thi (2018). *Preschool Teachers' Decision-Making Process in Reporting Child Abuse* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Walden University.
- Oakes, J., Maier, A., & Daniel, J. (2017). *Community schools: An evidence-based strategy for equitable school improvement*. National Education Policy Center. [https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/productfiles/Community\\_Schools\\_Evidence\\_Based\\_Strategy\\_BRIEF.pdf](https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/productfiles/Community_Schools_Evidence_Based_Strategy_BRIEF.pdf)
- Palmer, S., Maiter, S., & Manji, M., (2006). Effective intervention in Child Protective

- Services: Learning from parents. *Children and Youth Services*, 28(7), 812-824.
- Russell, J. R., Kerwin, C., Halverson, J. L. (2018). Is Child Protective Services effective? *Children and Youth Services Review*, 84(1), 185-192.
- Samuels, C. A. (2013). Preschools aim to better equip low-income parents. *Education Week*, 32(35), 1-4.
- Solomon, D., & Asber, K. (2012). Effectiveness of Child Protective Services interventions as indicated by rates of recidivism. *Children and Youth Services*, 34(12), 2311-2318.
- Tillman, K. S., Prazak, M. D., Burrier, L., Miller, S., Benezra, M., & Lynch, L. (2015). Factors influencing school counselors' suspecting and reporting of childhood physical abuse: Investigating child, parent, school, and abuse characteristics. *Professional School Counseling*, 19(1), 103-115
- Turner, H. A., Vanderminden, J., Finkelhor, D., & Hamby, S. (2019). Child neglect and the broader context of child victimization. *Child Maltreatment*, 24(3), 265-274.
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (n.d.). *What is child abuse or neglect? What is the definition of child abuse and neglect?* U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <https://www.hhs.gov/answers/programs-for-families-and-children/what-is-child-abuse/index.html#:~:text=What%20is%20child%20abuse%20or%20neglect%3F,-What%20is%20the&text=%22Any%20recent%20act%20or%20failure,imminent%20risk%20of%20serious%20harm.%22>
- West, A. L., Dauber, S., Gagliardi, L., Correll, L., Lilli, A. C., & Daniels, J. (2020). Systematic review of community- and home-based interventions to support parenting and reduce risk of child maltreatment among families with substance-exposed newborns. *Child Maltreatment*, 25(2), 137-151.

Whitsel, C. M. & Lapham, K. (2014). Increasing programme effectiveness through parent empowerment: The Getting Ready for School project in Tajikistan. *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 22(1), 105-116.